

A Review of: "Western Sahara: Reasons for Extemporaneous Colonization and Decolonization 1885-1975"

by Jesús Martínez-Milán and Claudia Barona Castañeda¹

János Besenyő²

In late 2020, a conflict known as the Guerguerat crisis erupted with Sahrawis protesting against the Moroccan occupation of Western Sahara. The Sahrawis blocked the movement of trucks from Morocco to Mauritania and south on National Route 1, preventing them from proceeding. On 13 November 2020, the protesters were driven away by the Moroccans with armed force and were also shot at. The nearby Polisario gunmen reciprocated the fire. Fortunately, there were no fatalities in the short-lived clash, yet the Polisario Front denounced the ceasefire since 1991 and launched attacks on a fortification system built by Moroccans to protect the occupied territories from the displaced natives. (UNSC 2021) In the period since then, there have been low-intensity clashes in the area, in which Moroccans have also deployed drones. (Lebovich 2021) The clashes have once again drawn attention to the world's last colonial territory, where indigenous people are still unable to exercise their right to selfdetermination and decide to live in their own independent country or autonomously within Morocco. Unfortunately, the peacekeeping operation set up by the United Nations, MINURSO, is unable to achieve the goal of organising and conducting a referendum for indigenous peoples for which it was set up, so its activities are limited to maintaining the status quo that has existed since 1991. Perhaps thanks to this, the issue of Western Sahara has once again been addressed at several conferences and several publications have been published on the fate of the area. These include the book "Western Sahara, Reasons for Extemporaneous Colonization and Decolonization 1885-1975" published by Nova Science Publishers at the end of 2021 and noted by Jesús Martínez-Milán³ és Claudia Barona Castañeda⁴.

The well-structured and detailed book deals with the Spanish colonisation of Western

165

¹ Martínez-Milán, Jesús and Castañeda, Claudia Barona, *Western Sahara: Reasons for Extemporaneous Colonization and Decolonization 1885-1975.* New York: Nova Science Publishers, 2021. ISBN: 978-1-68507-334-3. pp. 177.

² Head of institute at Africa Research Institute, School on Safety and Security Sciences, Óbuda University, Budapest, Hungary; ORCID: 0000-0001-7198-9328.

³ Senior Lecturer in Economic History/Lecturer in International Relations, University of las Palmas of Grand Canary, Spain; University of the Americans, Puebla, México. Degree in Geography and History (History section) from the University of Salamanca in 1983. Doctor in Contemporary History from the National Distance Education University (UNED) of Madrid, in 2000. Area of Knowledge: History and Economic Institutions. Main lines of research: Colonisation and Decolonisation. Spanish investments in Morocco and Western Sahara in the 19th and 20th centuries. Public company and mining.

⁴ Professor and Social Science Research specialist, Department of International Relations and Political Science, University of the Americans, Puebla, Mexico. Doctorate in Philosophy with a specialization in Arab and Islamic Studies and International Mediterranean Studies, Autonomous University of Madrid. BA in History, National School of Anthropology and History. Area of Knowledge: History of Africa, national identity social movements tribalism and colonisation state and society. Western Sahara and social movements in Western Sahara and the Sahel.



Sahara and the Spanish period, followed by the withdrawal of the Spaniards, which is essential to understanding the current conflict. The authors present in a short introduction the reason for the choice of topic, the research they have carried out and the structure of the book. From this, it turns out that a lot of material has been kept in Spanish archives that could not be researched until now. Furthermore, several people who were themselves active shapers of the daily life of the former Spanish Sahara and then the organisers and executors of the Spanish departure were interviewed. The book is already a curiosity for that reason alone, and because the Spanish archival material researched on this topic has not been published in English yet.

In the first chapter, we get to know the region, the period before the arrival of the Europeans, the society of the people living there, the activities of the different tribes, and the operation of trans-Saharan trade. In the second chapter, the authors present the processes leading to the Spanish colonisation and the occupation of the area, as well as the relations between the Spaniards and the natives between 1885 and 1933. They make it clear that the Kingdom of Spain, which had already gone far beyond its peak at the time, occupied the Río de Oro peninsula in what is now Western Sahara. This was only to give the Canary Islands greater security against other European powers ready to colonise and to protect the interests of the Spanish fishermen operating there (p. 22). Therefore, the Spaniards preferred to occupy the shores of Western Sahara for economic reasons and did not wish to expand inland. However, the new colony did not live up to expectations and only made a loss to the treasury. Moreover, in 1898, the Spaniards were defeated in the war for Cuba by the United States, resulting in the loss of a significant portion of their colonies. (Nunez 2015, pp. 195-196) The authors mentioned that both the British and the French wanted to annex the territory to their own colonial empires (p. 28-30), but this did not happen, and the territory remained in the hands of the Spaniards until 1975. Interestingly, the authors do not mention that Compania Transatlantica, which used the commercial station Villa Cisneros in 1899, with the approval of the Spanish leadership, offered to lease the area to the Austro-Hungarian Colonial Society (Österreichisch-Ungarische Kolonialgesellschaft), founded in 1895, for 30 or 90 years. The issue reached the highest level of the Austro-Hungarian state formation, and after the approval of the political leadership, negotiations began on the lease of the area. The Foreign Minister of the Austro-Hungarian Monarchy instructed the Consul in Tangier, Count Gilbert von Hohenwart, to gather as much information as possible about the area, which he did conscientiously. His report confirmed that Río de Oro was only making a loss for the Spaniards, but nevertheless believed the Monarchy could make the area profitable. According to one paragraph of the report, "the Spanish colony consists of 1 captain, 1 lieutenant, 1 noncommissioned officer, 2 corporals, 27 soldiers, 1 physician, 1 engineer, 1 fireman, and 5 employees of the Spanish naval artillery, a total of 40 people. The indigenous colony consists of 54 to 60 fishermen in 12 families and 7 Sudanese Negroes". (HU MNL OL W253 N 0028 and HU_MNL_OL_W253_N_0029) These data coincide with those in the table prepared by the authors, which shows the evolution of the population of Villa Cisneros between 1897 and 1909 (p. 33). The count saw a good opportunity in the development of ports and fishing, and also



wanted to play a more active role in the trans-Saharan trade. The Monarchy was so excited by the possibility of a possible colonial acquisition that even an expedition was launched into the area to learn as much as possible about it. Meanwhile, the Spaniards prepared an amendment to the law to hand over the area, and a working group worked out the conditions for leasing the area. The Spanish company, which operated the site, transferred the exploitation rights to a consortium until 31 December 1899, which was responsible for the sale. The consortium was led by Juan Bautista Somogy, a representative of Hungarian origin, who wanted to sell, but rather "lease", the area to a foreign trading company so that the Spanish crown would retain control over the area. However, the negotiations stalled due to the differences between the political and economic leadership of the Monarchy, and at the end of 1899 the Monarchy withdrew from the business that had been very important to it until then. (Besenyő 2020a, pp. 71-78) After this, the Spaniards decided to keep the area, although in the following years there was still a motion to "trade" it with the French. This did not happen, however, and they even began to slowly develop the area (pp. 31-39). In this chapter, we can also trace the Spanish-French negotiations and border agreements that form the borders of Western Sahara today. The policy of the Spaniards towards the Sahrawis, whom they were trying to win over with regular annuities and gifts within the policy of "peaceful penetration" or "sugar pylon", is very interesting. This practice confirmed in the natives that the Spaniards came to the Río de Oro not to colonise but to trade (p. 40-46, 141).

In the next, third chapter, we learn about the French and Spanish interests and counterinterests, how the two colonial powers competed and, if necessary, cooperated against the natives who carried out attacks on French forces stationed in Mauritania from Spanish territory (p. 52). As a result, several conflicts arose between the colonial powers, which led to the Spaniards being forced to cooperate with the French and to make certain improvements in their colonies. However, spectacular developments took place during the period marked by the reign of Franco (1940-1973), which are dealt with in the fourth chapter. It can be seen from this that the area became more valuable to the Spanish leadership, under which the administration has been restructured and economic developments have been carried out, leading to an increase in the population (p. 66-71, 79-83). Meanwhile, independence aspirations in the surrounding states also emerged in Spanish-Saharan Africa, moreover, neighbouring Morocco claimed the territory. The Spaniards therefore sought to get the natives on their side and to placate the Moroccans by handing over the Tarfaya zone (p. 75). However, this yielded only temporary results, which led to the idea of the creation of an independent Sahrawi state under Spanish patronage (p. 78-79). Some indigenous peoples were dissatisfied with this and established their own liberation organisations, the Advanced Organisation for the Liberation of the Sahara (AOLS) and the Polisario Front (p. 83-94). The authors documented what was happening very thoroughly at the time, but when they write about the fate of Bassiri Muhammad wuld Hach Brahim wuld Lebser, the head of AOLS, they write: "According to the provincial government version, Bassiri was released on the border with Morocco (Barbulo 2002, 68-72). To date, there is no data confirming either hypothesis." (p. 89). This is contradicted by the fact that several Spanish soldiers, (León 2019, p. 71.; de



Riquelme 1991, p. 610) and even then-governor Pérez de Lerma, claimed that the Sahrawi political leader was executed by soldiers of the Legion and then buried in the desert outside El-Aaiún. (Besenyő 2020b) In the fifth chapter, we can see how the Spanish government sought to exploit the area's natural resources. What developments were made in the fisheries sector (p. 96-102), how phosphate fields and other valuable minerals were discovered and how they benefited from them. However, they succeeded in achieving this only to a limited extent (p. 102-118). In the sixth chapter, readers can learn about the last two years of Spanish colonial rule, when Franco, who ruled Spain with an iron fist, is pushed back by his illness. Those who wanted to inherit did not really know what to do with the Sahrawi colony. They first wanted to give autonomy to the natives (p. 120) and then asked the Arab League to make decisions about the fate of the area (p. 121-122). However, none of these materialised, as Morocco's demands for the area were supported by the United States and France. The Polisario Front, representing an increasing number of indigenous peoples, launched an armed struggle against the Spaniards to force them to leave the area (p. 123-124, 136-137). However, this led the Spaniards not to carry out the decolonisation of their former colony, but to hand it over to Morocco and Mauritania (p. 144), who occupied Western Sahara with arms against the will of the natives, resulting in a 16-year war.

In addition to the well-written chapters, the index created by the authors and the various tables and diagrams help the readers to find their way. Unfortunately, this is less true of maps, the size and quality of some of which leave something to be desired in several cases (p. 2, 28, 34, 50, 106, 110). It would also have been useful to publish a list of the maps and other figures and diagrams at the beginning of the book. The literature used by the authors is very impressive, but I miss from the English literature John Mercer's book *Spanish Sahara*, which is one of the most basic sources on Spanish-Sahara alongside Tony Hodges' book. However, these do not detract from the value of this gap-filling volume that I recommend to anyone who is studying African studies, political history, security policy, and history, or to those interested in the Maghreb region.

Bibliography

Besenyő, J. (2020a) *Magyarország és a nyugat-szaharai válság* [Hungary and the crisis in Western Sahara], Budapest: Monarchia Kiadó.

Besenyő, J. (2020b) 'The role of the Spanish Legion in the Spanish possessions of Ifni, Tarfaya and West Sahara', *Revista Digital de Historia Militar*, ISSN 2254-3619, July 15. Available at https://historiamilitar.es/the-role-of-the-spanish-legion-in-the-spanish-possessions-of-ifni-tarfaya-and-west-sahara/?fbclid=IwAR1-kEALBT65hDyxbenRlpRC9B6yiDi1VtUqtpwnCvNb22W7ye4agSr6jvw (Accessed 30 November 2021).

del Riquelme, J. P. P. (1991) *Historia de los saharauis y crónica de la agresión colonial en el Sáhara Occidental* (PhD dissertation). Universidad Complutense de Madrid. Available at https://eprints.ucm.es/id/eprint/1768/ (Accessed 30 November 2021).

Hungarian National Archive, HU_MNL_OL_W253_N_0028 and HU_MNL_OL_W253_N_0029.



Lebovich, A. (2021) 'Crisis to watch: Western Sahara', *Italian Institute for International Political Studies*, December 22. Available at https://www.ispionline.it/en/publication/crisis-watch-western-sahara-32768 (Accessed 30 November 2021).

León, E. S. (2019) Comparative analysis of the decolonisation of the Spanish Protectorate in Morocco and the frustrated attempt in Western Sahara (1945-1976): Cultural clash, inhabitants and administration. Erasmus University Thesis Repository, Maatschappijgeschiedenis/History of Society. Available at http://hdl.handle.net/2105/49930 (Accessed 30 November 2021).

Nunez, X.-M. (2015) 'Nation-Building and Regional Integration: The Case of the Spanish Empire (1700-1914)' in Miller, A. and Berger, S. (eds.) *Nationalizing Empires*. Budapest/New York: CEU Press.

UNSC (2021) 'S/2021/843 Situation concerning Western Sahara, Report of the Secretary-General', *United Nations Security Council*, October 1. Available at https://minurso.unmissions.org/ sites/default/files/unsg_report_october_2021.pdf (Accessed 30 November 2021).



Author Guide

Guidelines for Authors submitting Articles or Research Notes

to the Journal of Central and Eastern European African Studies (JCEEAS)

Preparing Your Paper

Structure

Your paper should be compiled in the following order: title page; abstract; keywords; main text introduction, materials and methods, results, discussion; acknowledgments; declaration of interest statement; references; appendices (as appropriate); table(s) with caption(s) (on individual pages); figures; figure captions (as a list).

Word Limits

Please include a word count for your paper.

A typical paper for this journal should be no more than 10,000 words.

Style of Referencing

Authors may only submit their paper in Harvard style, using in-text citations. Manuscripts may be supplied as single or multiple files. These can be Word, rich text format (rtf), open document format (odt), or PDF files. Figures and tables can be placed within the text or submitted as separate documents. Figures should be of sufficient resolution to enable refereeing.

There are no strict formatting requirements, but all manuscripts must contain the essential elements needed to evaluate a manuscript: abstract, author affiliation, figures, tables, funder information, and references. Further details may be requested upon acceptance.

References can be in any style or format, so long as a consistent scholarly citation format is applied. Author name(s), journal or book title, article or chapter title, year of publication, volume and issue (where appropriate) and page numbers are essential. All bibliographic entries must contain a corresponding in-text citation. The addition of DOI (Digital Object Identifier) numbers is recommended but not essential.

Spelling can be US or UK English so long as usage is consistent.

Note that, regardless of the file format of the original submission, an editable version of the article must be supplied at the revision stage.



Checklist: What to Include

Author details. All authors of a manuscript should include their full name and affiliation on the cover page of the manuscript. Where available, please also include ORCiDs and social media handles (Facebook, Twitter or LinkedIn). One author will need to be identified as the corresponding author, with their email address normally displayed in the article PDF (depending on the journal) and the online article. Authors' affiliations are the affiliations where the research was conducted. If any of the named co-authors moves affiliation during the peer-review process, the new affiliation can be given as a footnote. Please note that no changes to affiliation can be made after your paper is accepted.

Should contain an unstructured abstract of 200 words.

Between 3 and 5 keywords. Read making your article more discoverable, including information on choosing a title and search engine optimization.

Funding details. Please supply all details required by your funding and grant-awarding bodies as follows:

For single agency grants

This work was supported by the [Funding Agency] under Grant [number xxxx].

For multiple agency grants

This work was supported by the [Funding Agency #1] under Grant [number xxxx]; [Funding Agency #2] under Grant [number xxxx]; and [Funding Agency #3] under Grant [number xxxx].

Disclosure statement. This is to acknowledge any financial interest or benefit that has arisen from the direct applications of your research. Further guidance on what is a conflict of interest and how to disclose it.

Biographical note. Please supply a short biographical note for each author. This could be adapted from your departmental website or academic networking profile and should be relatively brief (e.g., no more than 200 words).

Data availability statement. If there is a data set associated with the paper, please provide information about where the data supporting the results or analyses presented in the paper can be found. Where applicable, this should include the hyperlink, DOI or other persistent identifier associated with the data set(s). Templates are also available to support authors.

Data deposition. If you choose to share or make the data underlying the study open, please deposit your data in a recognized data repository prior to or at the time of submission. You will be asked to provide the DOI, pre-reserved DOI, or other persistent identifier for the data set.

Supplemental online material. Supplemental material can be a video, dataset, fileset, sound file or anything which supports (and is pertinent to) your paper. We publish supplemental



material online via Figshare. Find out more about supplemental material and how to submit it with your article.

Figures. Figures should be high quality (1200 dpi for line art, 600 dpi for grayscale and 300 dpi for color, at the correct size). Figures should be supplied in one of our preferred file formats: EPS, PDF, PS, JPEG, TIFF, or Microsoft Word (DOC or DOCX) files are acceptable for figures that have been drawn in Word. For information relating to other file types, please consult our Submission of electronic artwork document.

Tables. Tables should present new information rather than duplicating what is in the text. Readers should be able to interpret the table without reference to the text. Please supply editable files.

Equations. If you are submitting your manuscript as a Word document, please ensure that equations are editable. More information about mathematical symbols and equations.

Units. Please use SI units (non-italicized).

Using Third-Party Material in your Paper

You must obtain the necessary permission to reuse third-party material in your article. The use of short extracts of text and some other types of material is usually permitted, on a limited basis, for the purposes of criticism and review without securing formal permission. If you wish to include any material in your paper for which you do not hold copyright, and which is not covered by this informal agreement, you will need to obtain written permission from the copyright owner prior to submission. More information on requesting permission to reproduce work(s) under copyright.

Submitting Your Paper

By submitting your paper to the Journal of Central and Eastern European African Studies you are agreeing to originality checks during the peer-review and production processes.

The text should be sent to the editor-in-chief at <besenyo.janos@uni-obuda.hu>, with copy to the co-editor <karman.marianna@uni-obuda.hu>, together with an assurance that the MS has not been submitted to another journal and will not be submitted while under review with JCEEAS. The MS should be unpublished - and this includes online publications.

Texts should be research-based, original and not published elsewhere before (with some exceptions being made for non-English publication elsewhere).

The copyright of the text stays with the author(s); so does responsibility for content.

Publication Charges

There are no submission fees, publication fees or page charges for this journal.

Journal of Central and Eastern European African Studies

Founder, Head of the Editorial Team János Besenyő – Óbuda University, Budapest, Hungary

Publisher

Rajnai Zoltán – Óbuda University, Budapest, Hungary

Editors

Ádám Mayer – Széchenyi István University, Győr, Hungary Szabolcs Pásztor – National University of Public Service, Budapest, Hungary Cyprian Alexander Kozera – War Studies University, Warsaw, Poland

Advisory Editorial Board

Oladele Bamidele Daji – Nigerian Defence Acedemy, Kaduna, Nigeria Toyin Falola – University of Texas, Austin, USA Jeffrey Kaplan – University of Wisconsin Oshkosh, USA Yahia Zoubir – KEDGE Business School, Paris, France

Editorial Board

Abdallah Abdel-Ati Abdel-Salam Mohamed – Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest, Hungary Mirela Atanasiu - National Defence University, Bucharest, Romania Luís Manuel Brás Bernardino – University of Lisbon, Portugal Liliana Brožič – New University, Kranj, Slovenia Gábor Búr – Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest, Hungary Jan Goldman – The Citadel, Military College of South Carolina, Charleston, USA Marcin Górnikiewicz – Military University of Technology, Warsaw, Poland Simona Mariana Corlan Ioan - University of Bucharest, Romania Péter Gergő Juhász – Óbuda University, Budapest, Hungary Moses Khanyile - Stellenbosch University, South Africa Judit Kiss – Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Hungary Andrey Vitalyevich Korotayev – Moscow State University, Russia Viktor Marsai – National University of Public Service, Budapest, Hungary Jesús Maria Martínez Milán – University of Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, Spain Maxim Matusevich - Seton Hall University, South Orange, New Jersey, USA Szilveszter Póczik – National Institute of Criminology, Budapest, Hungary Błażej Popławski – Polish Academy of Sciences, Warsaw, Poland István Rákóczi – Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest, Hungary Colin Robinson - Wellington, New Zealand Carlos Ruiz Miguel – University of Santiago de Compostela, Spain Petr Skalník – Masaryk University, Prague, Czech Tatiana Smirnova – University of Quebec, Montreal, Canada Béla Szilágyi – Hungarian Baptist Aid, Budapest, Hungary István Tarrósy – University of Pécs, Hungary Darko Trifunovic – University of Belgrade, Serbia András Türke – Europa Varietas Institute, Swizterland Maurício Waldman – University of São Paulo, Brazil

Editorial Staff

Marianna Kármán – Dávid Vogel – Gábor Sinkó – Éva Hegedűs – Marcell Pintér

Online version https://jceeas.bdi.uni-obuda.hu/

Contact

Publisher: Óbuda University, Hungary - 1034 Budapest, Bécsi út 96/B Editorial Office: Africa Research Institute, Doctoral School on Safety and Security Sciences, Óbuda University, Hungary – 1081 Budapest, Népszínház u. 8. III. 316. +36205585579; besenyo.janos@uni-obuda.hu. Africa Research



ISSN 2786-1902

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may, for sales purposes, be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means.